A Framework for Evaluating Supervisors on Talent Development

Nick Byrne, Sarah Hazel, Maggie Parker, & Deepti Panjabi
October 29, 2013
Presentation Overview

- Research Questions
- Definition of Talent Development
- Methodology
- A Framework for Evaluating Supervisors on Talent Development
- Practitioner Examples
- Questions
Research Questions

- How can the City of Durham develop a process to incorporate talent development as a performance expectation for supervisors’ appraisal?

- What best practices can inform the City of Durham’s process?
What is Talent Development?
An umbrella term that describes the many training experiences, work assignments, and mentoring relationships that move people ahead in their vocation (HBR 2011).
Methodology

• 13 Semi-Structured Interviews with cities/counties identified by The Alliance for Innovation & ICMA
  • 2 organizations identified by team members

• Literature Review conducted in Public & Private sectors

• Expert Opinions
Who did we interview?

8 out of 13 organizations require Talent Development as a Supervisor Performance Expectation
Expert Opinion

Frank Benest

Lou O’Boyle

Rebecca Veazey
A Framework for Evaluating Supervisors on Talent Development
Job Description

- Communicates job performance expectations prior to hiring
- Communicates the values of the organization (Veazey 2013)
- Helps with compliance (Veazey 2013)
Communicating Job Expectations

Minimum Qualification(s) Required. “leadership positions in organizational management system design, performance management, process improvement, strategic planning, project management, and/or coaching/mentoring.”

- City of Mesa, AZ
Key Takeaways

Supervisor job descriptions should communicate the supervisor’s role and responsibilities in employee talent development.

Supervisor job descriptions should align with their performance expectations.
Supervisor Buy-In

• Success Factor
  – 43 percent of organizations were successful in implementing their change initiatives; the biggest factor to their success was buy-in (Towers Watson 2011)

• Obstacle
  – Found the most significant obstacles to change included: lack of senior leader buy-in, pushback from employees, middle-manager pushback, and ineffective communication (Prosci 2012)
Achieving Supervisor Buy-in

- Provide context and education
- Engage supervisors in the design of the program
- Pilot the program
- Shared Responsibility
- Promote from within
Provide Context and Education

Tip Sheet for Senior Managers and Aspiring Managers

Premise:
• Participants in leadership development programs will return with new ideas, new enthusiasm, and new competencies that serve your unit well

Big Workload/No Time
• Complete a rigorous assessment of the person’s duties and cover only the highest-priority tasks
• Allocate responsibilities to others in the organization that want growth opportunities

(City of Tracy, CA)
Designing and Piloting Programs

**Supervisors Design Programs**

**MENTORSHIP PROGRAM**

Supervisors:
- ✓ Developed program
- ✓ Select Participants
- ✓ Match Mentors to mentees
- ✓ Act as Mentors

City of Delray Beach, FL

**Supervisors Pilot Programs**

**JOB SHADOW PILOT**

Employees:
- ✓ Small group doing job shadowing within a few departments

City of Tracy, CA

**Supervisors Share Responsibility**

**INDIVIDUAL ACTION PLANS**

Employees:
- ✓ Develop learning objectives
- ✓ Develop learning strategies
- ✓ Set targets

Sedgwick County, KS
Promote From Within

“Everyone embraces succession planning because we hire and promote internally. Everyone wants to see their mentees succeed.”

- Emily Graft, Assistant to the Manager

(Sedgwick County, KS)
Challenges to Supervisor Buy-In

• Lack of time
• Juggling multiple responsibilities
• Fear of being replaced
• Inadequate training that results in under confident supervisors
Key Takeaways

- Provide context and education for supervisors about their role.
- Engage supervisors in the design of and get continual feedback.
- Pilot the program.
- Reinforce shared responsibility and promote from within.
Performance Expectations

**Three Major Components:**

- Decide on appropriate expectations
- Be clear about what constitutes meeting the expectation and what constitutes a high level of performance
- Clearly articulate expectations before the first evaluation and provide coaching along the way
# Creating Performance Measures for Supervisors

## Quantitative Measures
- Development conversations quarterly
- Created and followed up on an learning plans
- Number of direct reports promoted

## Qualitative Measures
- Incorporate behavioral elements into the evaluation plan:
  - Highly effective trainer
  - Mentorship skills
  - Effective Communication

(Frank Benest)
### Setting Expectations Clearly for Supervisors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fails to Achieve (1)</th>
<th>Needs Improvement (2)</th>
<th>Achieves (3)</th>
<th>Exceeds (4)</th>
<th>Outstanding (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Repeatedly fails to achieve or exhibits a pattern which fails to achieve one or more of the standards listed to the right</td>
<td>Needs to improve staff training and prepare employees better for advancement opportunities;</td>
<td>Employees are trained to perform their job successfully; creates a departmental succession plan</td>
<td>Has a pattern of providing effective on the job training and cross training.</td>
<td>Has a pattern of providing highly effective training and mentoring that successfully prepares employees for advancement and/or expands their capacities;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Takeaways

1. Decide on talent development supervisor performance expectations.
2. Outline a scale for measuring supervisor performance.
3. Meet multiple times to discuss performance and expectations with supervisors prior to evaluation.
Training

• **Emphasize “train the trainer”**
  - Dr. Frank Benest’s advice
  - Dept. of State Treasurer example

• **Collaborative coaching**
  - Dept. of State Treasurer

• **“Comprehensive” approaches**
  - Leadership Foundations (Albemarle County, VA)
  - City of Tracy, CA, Workforce Readiness Initiative
Training

A Note on Budget Constraints

• **Dept. of State Treasurer**: mandated the requirement without employing direct incentives.
  - But, still . . . program was successful based on survey results

• **Alachua County, FL**: no performance expectations around employee development.
  - Yet, optional training opportunities are still available and are well-received by employees.
Training: Key Takeaways

- Communication about performance expectations leads to feedback around training needs.
- Leverage networks, online resources, and membership affiliations to develop training programs.
- Focus on “having the conversation.”
- Train supervisors and employees on supervisory development skills.
Supervisor Evaluation & Data Collection

A successful performance evaluation system is contingent on knowing the employee.

Collecting information and meaningful feedback from employees throughout the performance evaluation process is critical.
# Supervisor Evaluation & Data Collection

## Notable Organizational Examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Data Collection Approach</th>
<th>Key Component(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alcoa</strong></td>
<td>Employee Index</td>
<td>Measures employee satisfaction re: supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NYC DOE</strong></td>
<td>360 Feedback</td>
<td>Supervisor evaluated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chesterfield Co., VA</strong></td>
<td>Chesterfield University</td>
<td>EDP: Open communication process (mutual evaluation process)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sedgwick Co., KS</strong></td>
<td>Individual Action Plans</td>
<td>Devise training plans</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supervisor Evaluation & Data Collection: Key Takeaways

- Collect feedback regularly from employees.
- Create a measurement system which holds supervisors accountable.
- In collecting the date, incorporate diverse set of tools: self-evaluation, employee evaluations, surveys and peer evaluations.
Rewards and Recognition

• Create a system for:
  o Demonstrating supervisor’s value
  o Enhancing supervisor production
  o Highlighting workplace results
• Essential to implementing new performance measures
Rewards and Recognition

- **Non-Monetary Recognition**
  - Leadership Development
    - NYC Department of Education’s Chancellor Fellowship
  - Supervisor Recognition
    - NC Department of State Treasurer
Recipients of Divisional Employee Recognition Awards:

- Building Brighter Futures Outstanding Achievement Award
- Walk the Walk Leadership/Mentor Award
- The Make-Their-Day Customer Service Award
- The Now-That’s -’Tude Fish Award
- The Out of the Cubicle Creativity Award
- The Behind the Scenes Award
Key Takeaways

- Design and implement a recognition system with both formal and informal characteristics.
- Link employee rewards and recognition back to overall organizational missions and objectives.
Supervisors Leave their Legacy
Thank You!